



Oxford Policy Management



MINISTRY OF EDUCATION AND VOCATIONAL TRAINING

Zanzibar

Education Situation Analysis

Key Findings

Final Report

Paul Murphy, Georgina Rawle, Nicola Ruddle,

January 2016

Key findings from the Zanzibar Education Sector Analysis

Box 1: Key findings: An introduction

Context for this situation analysis

- Education has been a key component of Zanzibar's national development plans for the last 15 years. As the ZEDP comes to the end of its intended implementation period, the sector, led by the MoEVT, is preparing to develop a new programme for 2016 to 2020.
- The MoEVT will convene an ELAB to engage wide stakeholder consultation and participation in developing the new programme.
- This situation analysis aims to set out the current context and recent trends in the sector, to inform participants' discussions and eventual recommendations at the ELAB.
- Alongside this situation analysis, a review of implementation progress of the ZEDP was carried out by another team, and both reports should be used together to inform the ELAB.

Social indicators

- Over the last 50 years Zanzibar's population has grown substantially, and with more than 40% of the population under the age of 15, there are implications for future demand for services.
- It is estimated that 44% of Zanzibaris live in poverty. Access to safe drinking water is good, but there are still challenges of malnutrition in children, and high risk of malaria in adults. HIV/AIDS is not a major problem in Zanzibar – only 1% of the population are infected.

Economic indicators

- There has been relatively good economic growth in the last decade, averaging 6.1% over the last seven years. However, with a dependence on agriculture, trade and tourism, Zanzibar is vulnerable to external shocks, such as the weather and the global economy. In 2014, GDP per capita was USD 939.
- The Government's expected revenue collection – and therefore funds available for the national budget – fell from 42% of GDP in 2010/11 to 33% of GDP in 2014/15.
- Zanzibar is highly dependent on external financing for its national budget. Loans and grants for development projects make up around a third of expected revenue, and donors also provide general budget support.

Box 2: Key findings on enrolment, internal efficiency and OOSC

Structure of the system

- The education system is in a period of transition to the 12 years of compulsory basic education stipulated in the 2006 Education Policy. The last cohort studying under the older system will move to Form 1, the start of ordinary secondary education, in 2016 (as part of a double-cohort).

Enrolment capacity (GERs)

- The pre-primary system is the only school subsector which has been expanding capacity to enrol the eligible population in the past six years. Enrolment almost doubled, with growth concentrated in public schools. Current capacity is between 33% and 50% of the eligible population.
- The primary system continues to have sufficient places to enrol the eligible population, although not at policy norms for class sizes because of acute classroom shortages. Enrolment growth has kept pace with population growth.
- At ordinary secondary level, GERs have fallen slightly over the past six years. The system currently accommodates 65% of the eligible population, but there are classroom shortages which will become acute as a double-cohort enters Form 1 in 2016.
- The GER at advanced secondary (Forms 5 and 6) has been on a downwards trajectory since 2009 and is now at around 5%. This is partly explained by an increasing trend for Form 4 students who qualify for Form 5 to opt to enter colleges instead.
- Places in the three public TVET institutions are equivalent to 0.5% of secondary school places, so public provision is very limited. The limited data available on private provision from the VTA estimates that private enrolment is at least four times as high as public enrolment.
- MoEVT tertiary institutions in Zanzibar are rapidly increasing capacity. They provide places for 525 students per 100,000 inhabitants, up from 403 in 2009. Taking account of all tertiary students (in Zanzibar, the mainland and abroad), this rises to 794 tertiary students per 100,000 inhabitants.

Schooling coverage: proportion of population with access to education

- More than 40% of Standard 1 children report having attended pre-primary education.
- Almost all children enter primary school at some point, most (89%) reach the final Standard, and almost all students in the final grade transition to ordinary secondary level.
- Access to ordinary secondary education falls by half over the four-year cycle (from 86% to 43%), mainly because many students fail the Form 2 selective examination. This means that considerably less than half of children have access to the final form of ordinary secondary. The system is still in transition, from a policy where compulsory basic education ended at Form 2 to the current policy, which applies to the cohort of students who are entering Form 1 in 2016.
- Access to advanced secondary or college education is about 6%, so the system narrows markedly at this point.

Retention, dropout and internal efficiency

- Retention in the primary cycle is reasonably good.
- Retention is a huge problem in the secondary cycle. Most students leave the system between Forms 2 and 3 and Forms 4 and 5, the stages where standardised testing takes place.
- Apart from the pushout of students from the system induced by standardised testing, a mixture of supply- and demand-side factors are reported to contribute to dropout levels. These include a lack of interest in schooling, being over-age, and economic factors.
- Repetition rates are low in both the primary and secondary cycles, but they are relatively high in Standard 1, which is costly and unlikely to be an effective way of supporting weaker students to reach learning standards. Children without pre-schooling are likely to be particularly vulnerable to the risk of early repetition.

OOSC

- About 15% of primary-aged children were out of school in 2010. This translates to about 37,000 children in 2014, assuming the rate has remained constant. Most of these children (25,000) can be expected to enter the system later, highlighting the problem of over-age students.

Box 3: Key findings of the cost and financing overview

- MoEVT spending has increased from TZS 59 billion in 2010/11 to TZS 90 billion in 2014/15. In

this time, the balance between recurrent and development has shifted towards recurrent, with salaries accounting for 77% of spending in 2014/15, up from 60% in 2010/11. The proportion of spending given to development projects has fallen, and this mostly reflects a reduction in donor funds, which make up 90% of development expenditure.

- For the last decade, the MoEVT's spending has accounted for around 16–22% of the national budget. At the same time, this spending had a value of 3.8–4.5% of GDP. This means that Zanzibar is meeting international recommendations for prioritising education in national spending (15–20%), but is on the low side in terms of relative actual amount (4–6% of GDP). Again, salaries are the major driver of spending: 38% of the Government's total spending on ministry salaries goes to the MoEVT.
- While salaries are always prioritised and honoured, non-salary recurrent spending is more likely to be squeezed out and not receive its full budget from the MoF. In 2014/15, non-salary spending was only 68% of the original budget.
- It is estimated that households allocate around 2% of their expenditure to education. In 2014 schools received an average of TZS 2,300 per student in primary and TZS 7,500 in secondary from parents.
- The announcement in 2015 to abolish voluntary contributions and government to provide the items needed by schools comes with a number of implementation risks:
 - It leaves schools with no funds for discretionary needs, and no clear guidance on how schools should fund items which government will not pay for, such as utilities.
 - It may mean that there may also be inefficiencies in allocating items across schools, with some receiving more or less than they need.
 - There is a very real problem of the MoF not making the budgeted funds available to the MoEVT. When this happens, the MoEVT will have to prioritise what to buy, but also manage the communication with, and expectations of, parents and schools. There can be a serious impact on the quality of teaching and learning if these items are squeezed out.

Box 4: A closer look at the MoEVT budget: key findings

- Under the recurrent budget, salaries dominate the expenditure, accounting for 90% of recurrent spending in 2014/15.
- Within the allocation of the non-salary recurrent budget, the semi-autonomous bodies receiving subvention, and MoEVT departments at Unguja, tend to have a higher execution rate than coordinating units at Pemba – meaning that they receive and spend more of their original budget. However, for the Unguja departments this is partly explained by the centralised purchasing of items – such as exam fees, furniture, and sports goods.
- Pre-primary and primary education receives the largest share of spending, at around 50%, although this has been recently declining. This is followed by secondary and then tertiary. However, when salaries and development expenditure are removed, we see that tertiary takes over 50% of non-salary recurrent spending due to the large amount spent on student loans.
- Development expenditure has fallen quite substantially in the last two years, as some large projects were phased out in 2013. At under TZS 10 billion in 2014/15, development projects accounted for 10% of MoEVT spending, far less than the TZS 28 billion in 2012/13, which was almost 30% of spending. Funds from donors vastly outweigh government contributions in terms of development projects.
- In terms of unit costs, the average recurrent spending per student is highest for TVET at the VTCs and KIST, generally TZS 2–4 million per student per year in the last five years. Secondary is next highest at around TZS 350,000 in 2014/15, followed by pre- and primary (TZS 129,000) and adult/alternative education (TZS 67,000).
- Average teacher salaries are estimated to be around 2.2 times GDP per capita, which is low compared to international guidelines of 3.5.

Box 5: Key findings on student learning**Primary students**

- Learning achievement of primary students appears to have declined gradually over the past six years.
- More than 20% of students entering secondary education have failed the Standard 7 examination and are very underprepared for the next stage of their education.
- Standard 7 performance in mathematics is particularly poor. It appears that the majority of early grade students are struggling to acquire foundational skills such as simple addition and subtraction.
- Standard 7 performance in language (Arabic, English and Kiswahili) is also relatively poor, but the breakdown between the languages is not available. A sizable group of students are struggling to learn to read in Kiswahili in the early years, but by Standard 6 a large group of students are competent readers (assuming that the situation has not declined markedly since 2007).

Ordinary secondary students

- About 55% of enrolled Form 2 students pass the examination and transition to Form 3, while 45% either do not take the examination or fail the assessment.
- Average scores in the Form 2 examination are low and vary widely by subject. In 2014 average scores ranged from 43% for Kiswahili to 15% for mathematics.
- The Form 4 examination pass rate has been very volatile over the past six years, with year-on-year changes of between six and 26 percentage points.
- The gap between the Form 4 examination pass rate and the percentage of students who meet the grade needed to proceed to Form 5 is very large. In 2014, 57% of public students passed, while only 13% qualified to continue their A-level studies.
- According to rigorous quantitative research, school factors, notably teachers' level of experience and qualification, as well as their practices of regular marking of homework and continuous assessment, are key factors affecting Form 4 results.
- The large variation in the Form 5 qualifying pass rate in recent years translates into considerable fluctuation in the transition rate between ordinary and advanced secondary and in absolute numbers of students.
- Some students who qualify for Form 5, perhaps the majority in some years, are opting to study in colleges for diplomas rather than to stay in school and take A-levels.

Advanced secondary students

- The Form 6 pass rate fluctuated around 80% for the four years from 2009/10, but in 2013/14 there was a marked increase to 96%. The share of candidates obtaining the highest divisions (I and II) also jumped from less than 10% in the earlier years to 20%.

Assessment system

- The assessment system itself is problematic. Some symptoms are: (i) the volatility in the externally set examination pass rates and pass rates by division over time, when access has not been shifting dramatically; and (ii) the low correlation between Form 2 and Form 4 results.

Box 6: Key findings on teachers and classrooms**Teachers**

- There are sufficient numbers of teachers at every level and the vast majority have a teaching qualification.
- Projections of supply of and demand for primary and secondary teachers indicate numbers graduating are likely to be sufficient in the medium-term.
- There are quality issues, including a possible shortage of trained pre-primary teachers qualified to teach at that level, and limited numbers of mathematics and science teachers; in addition, most teachers have a very limited grasp of English, the language of instruction for five subjects at upper primary and all subjects in secondary.
- The motivation and morale of serving teachers is giving cause for concern.
- Processes for assessing teacher need and deploying recruited teachers are opaque and the recruitment process needs more educational input.
- The utilisation of serving teachers in schools is inefficient. There are a number of causes: at all levels, a shortage of classrooms restricts the number of classes and this reduces the number of contact hours; at primary level teachers of Standards 1–4 who should teach whole classes, do not.
- In-service pedagogical support through TCs and distance and e-learning courses for serving teachers all show promise but the TCs need greater resources to help their work.

Classrooms

- Given plans to expand the pre-primary system substantially, many additional classrooms will be needed: about 140 classrooms per year to 2020.
- There is an acute shortage of primary classrooms. Currently, there are 47 students per class on average, and 39% of classrooms are used for double-shifting.
- About 60 new primary classrooms need to be constructed per year until 2020 simply to keep up with population growth.
- There is a wide geographical disparity in the availability of classrooms in primary schools. The pupil to classroom ratio ranges from 41:1 in South District Unguja to 92:1 in Micheweni District in Pemba (public and private combined).
- The double-cohort due to enter Form 1 in 2016 will put enormous pressure on the physical infrastructure. Under current conditions, about 150 additional classrooms will be needed per year up to 2020 to cope with this.
- There is a wide geographical disparity in the availability of classrooms in secondary schools: the pupil to classroom ratio ranges from 34:1 in South District to 64:1 in Urban district (public and private combined).

Box 7: Key findings on system capacity

- The MoEVT central departments and units cover all key education subsectors and issues, and the autonomous agencies replicate those in well-functioning systems.
- The EMIS is established and functioning. Concerns include fragmentation of data sources, fragility of storage arrangements, and limited dissemination.
- Many of the autonomous agencies established have clearly defined functions and sufficient staff but very limited other resources to perform their functions.
- The process of discussing and planning desirable policy measures, such as establishing autonomous agencies or extending the years of compulsory schooling may not have included a medium-term analysis of the finance needed and of affordability.
- The decentralisation modalities involving Regional and District Education Offices are not well understood even by REOs and DEOs, and while these function well in large countries it could be questioned whether Zanzibar benefits from this type of decentralisation and whether it supports pupil learning.
- The Enacted Law of Local Authority could have a profound effect on responsibility for education delivery. This will need analysis and discussion, and the impact on each agency will need to be determined.
- School level supports for teachers are functioning and could function well. Greater community involvement could get more children enrolled at the appropriate age. Head teachers would benefit from more direct support.
- Zanzibar's intention to lessen the burden on parents by removing 'voluntary contributions' is laudable. However, replacing this finance with targeted purchases lessens school autonomy and may have a deleterious effect on learning.

Box 8: Key findings on equity***Learning achievement***

- Girls outperform boys on the Form 2 examination, while boys outperform girls in passing the Form 4 examination and qualifying for Form 5. By contrast, there is little gender inequality in either the Standard 7 or Form 4 pass rates overall.
- Results from learning achievement surveys at primary level suggest that the direction of gender disparity is different in reading Kiswahili (girls perform better) and mathematics (boys perform better).
- Gender inequality in pass rates varies a lot across districts, especially as the level of the examination increases. Examination performance tends to be better for boys than girls in Pemba and North A on Unguja, while it is much better for girls than boys in the Central and South districts of Unguja.
- There are very large disparities in examination pass rates across districts; the gap is particularly large for the Form 4 examination. The relative performance of districts to one another is not consistent in the different examinations.

Inequality in enrolment capacity and exclusion

- For primary school-aged children, being a boy, living in a rural area, coming from the poor household or a household where the head is uneducated are all factors associated with being out of school. Boys who live in the poorest fifth of households have a 43% chance of not being in primary school.
- Children with disabilities have considerably higher rates of school exclusion than average.
- The district where a child lives makes a huge difference in the extent to which school places are currently available and taken up.
- The pre-primary system's capacity to enrol children (measured by GERs) is lowest in Wete and Chake Chake in Pemba.
- The primary and ordinary secondary systems have lowest enrolment capacity (measured by GERs) in Micheweni in Pemba and North B in Unguja.
- At pre-primary and primary level, most districts are close to gender parity in enrolment, but at ordinary secondary level female students outnumber males in all districts.

Inequality in resourcing

- Pemba's four districts are the most disadvantaged in public teacher numbers relative to pupils, at pre-primary, primary and secondary levels, compared with other districts.
- Micheweni and Mkoani in Pemba are also comparatively under-resourced in public classrooms relative to the student numbers, but the most populated districts in Zanzibar have the greatest shortages of pre-primary and primary public classrooms (West) and secondary classrooms (Urban).
- District disparities in public classroom provision have narrowed in the past five years because the Government has been targeting additional classrooms towards districts with the greatest needs.

Box 9: Key findings on ECD

- Between a quarter and half of Zanzibar's children have access to pre-school; there has been considerable improvement in access over the past five years but is still low. Many of those who are enrolled are over-age. Of total enrolment in pre-primary centres, 55% are enrolled in privately run pre-schools and the rest in government schools or Tutu centres (2015).
- Income is a barrier to accessing pre-school, and this results in inequitable access. Children in the richest fifth of households are more than four times as likely to access pre-school as the poorest fifth.
- The Government is encouraging its primary schools to open pre-primary classes, but many details are yet to be worked out. Schools need to find enough space, and sufficient motivated and qualified teachers. The MoEVT has budgeted to supply materials to pre-schools, removing the need for voluntary contributions, but this has not been widely communicated. Implementation plans should be developed for the next five years based on different government sector growth scenarios, including the teachers, classrooms and finance needed and the likely implications for private providers and for primary schools.
- These new pre-primary classes attached to primary schools may suffer if the head teachers, teachers and parents are not well sensitised to the needs of ECE. The teaching style may be too academic, the content infiltrated by Standard 1 curriculum, and resources may be prioritised for higher levels in the school.
- Teaching at the pre-primary level has had a low reputation, not helped by the lack of training courses in Zanzibar. There will be some delay as new pre-primary teaching graduates are produced from the new courses at SUZA, MECPC, TCs and education colleges. Teachers should be placed in a pre-primary classroom only if they choose to be there.
- Community schools and Tutu centres are largely under-resourced, and may not be sustainable. As government schools open, competition may drive these other options to close. The Government should be aware and clear about this likelihood, and include this in the implementation plan mentioned earlier.
- There need to be clearer, agreed standards on pre-primary school infrastructure and teaching and learning quality, with guidance on the curriculum, for effective monitoring and accountability to take place.

Box 10: Key findings on tertiary education

- With three universities, three teachers' colleges and six other government colleges offering tertiary courses, Zanzibar's participation rates are well above the African average.
- The absorption of some of the other government institutions into SUZA should help quality. However, caution is needed to ensure some continue to offer non-degree courses that serve the broader world of work.
- The exam performance of secondary school leavers and the consequent small pool available for entry to universities is a cause for concern.
- An additional concern is employment rates for graduates of these tertiary institutions. Tracer studies are not available.
- The establishment of the ZHELBA, which provides loans, is a significant benefit to some Zanzibar families. Degrees are targeted for loans based on national priorities. Given the poor repayment record elsewhere in Africa long-term calculations of returns are needed to determine likely future finance.
- Higher education currently takes about 17% of MoEVT expenditure and this will rise as SUZA absorbs other government training institutions.
- Unit costs per graduate for SUZA are relatively high. As the institution enters a more stable growth phase these unit costs are likely to reduce.

Box 11: Key findings on adult literacy, alternative learning and continuing education**Adult literacy**

- Literacy rates increased from 71% to 80% over the decade to 2012 (census estimates), while at the same time the gender gap narrowed to four percentage points, down from 14 percentage points a decade earlier.
- Adult literacy classes are catering for about 6% of non-literate adults.
- Two-thirds of non-literate adults are female, and they are more likely to enrol in literacy classes than non-literate men.
- Adult literacy is an extremely resource-constrained service. Teachers are paid a meagre allowance, and most receive few teaching and learning materials.
- Retention in adult literacy classes is a problem – the number of Final Stage learners is equivalent on only one-quarter of First Stage learners.
- The majority of Final Stage learners report that they can read and write letters, but struggle with understanding large numbers. Most also report that they can carry out some essential life-relevant tasks that require literacy, such as reading a doctor's prescription.

Alternative learning programmes

- School-based alternative learning classes for children who have never entered school cover roughly 7% of the target group. About two-thirds of students enrolled go on to join the formal system.
- The alternative learning programme providing pre-vocational skills for young people aged 15–22 years is catering for an important need, but coverage is exceedingly low and the service is only available in one institution in Rahaleo (Urban district). Many teachers at the centre do not have vocational or technical expertise, and many are underutilised.

Continuing education

- The continuing education programmes cover a diverse range of small services. Enrolment is dropping and coverage of the target populations is extremely limited.
- Learners pay contributions for all programmes, unlike adult literacy or alternative learning students.
- Basic data needed to manage services effectively are not readily available. Much is either missing or inconsistent between sources. There is no information readily available on pass rates or completion rates for continuing education learners (either the O-level and A-level second-chance programmes or the others). This is an important data gap.

Overall subsector

- Provision is fragmented, dominated by public providers, and difficult to manage with the existing weak management information system. The subsector needs a coherent strategy, informed by targeted pieces of research where information is unreliable and incomplete, so it can better utilise existing resources and attract additional funds.

Box 12: Key findings on TVET

- There are a limited number of government providers but a large number of private providers of training courses in Zanzibar.
- Courses provided by KIST appear to be in demand, courses in the three VTCs do not and females are under-represented in all MoEVT courses.
- The VTA directly oversees the VTCs and has a QA role with private providers. However, oversight of private providers is very limited and quality is not ensured even in the VTCs. Independent observers find weak staff qualifications and limited equipment and workshops.
- A Skills Development Levy is paid by employers to Government but it is not clear where the money goes or for what purposes it is used.
- The VTCs do not carry out tracer studies of graduates nor do they have strong links with industry.

